

Musicology Today

Journal of the National University of Music Bucharest

Issue 4 (44) October-December 2020

Title: Researching Musical Relations between City, Town, and Village in the Southern, Central and Northern Balkans, from the 18th to the 20th Centuries

Author: Walter Zev Feldman

E-mail: walterzevfeldman@gmail.com

Source: Musicology Today: Journal of the National University of Music Bucharest / Volume 11 / Issue 4 (44) / October-December 2020, pp 243-257

Link to this article: musicologytoday.ro/44/MT44studiesFeldman.pdf

How to cite this article: Walter Zev Feldman, "Researching Musical Relations between City, Town, and Village in the Southern, Central and Northern Balkans, from the 18th to the 20th Centuries", *Musicology Today: Journal of the National University of Music Bucharest*, 11/4 (44) (2020), 243-257.

Published by: Editura Universității Naționale de Muzică București

Musicology Today: Journal of the National University of Music Bucharest is indexed by EBSCO, RILM, ERIH PLUS, and CEEOL

Walter Zev FELDMAN
New York University, Abu Dhabi

Researching Musical Relations between City, Town, and Village in the Southern, Central and Northern Balkans, from the 18th to the 20th Centuries*

Keywords: ethnomusicology, Balkan nations, inter-religious musical contacts, musical “intonatsia”, Mevlevi dervishes

During the 17th and 18th centuries and beyond, the Ottoman Empire and civilization had encompassed most – although not all – of the territories comprising the Balkan nations of today. It was thus the geographic scene for most of the processes of cultural “osmoses” – the inter-group interactions – that are the topic of this paper. Within Orthodox ecclesiastical music, much development was internal, or between the musical traditions of the various national churches. But by the later 17th century interactions with several musical traditions of the Ottoman capital began to effect musical life over a broad social and geographical sphere, and involving all the major religious groups of the Empire.

As can be imagined, it is extremely challenging to describe musical interactions within a variety of social strata in this broad territory, even during the past three centuries. It is doubtful that any one scholar would have either the linguistic or historical competence to treat every country and region adequately, and the present speaker is certainly not that person. Hopefully my experiences with Western Turkey and the Southern Balkans and then in the Moldavian/Wallachian North may help to equip me to make broader generalizations about everything in between.

* Paper presented on September 3, 2019 (Keynote Address 1) at the 8th International Musicological Conference *Musical and Cultural Osmoses in the Balkans*, organized by the International Musicological Society – Regional Association for the Study of Music of the Balkans, and hosted by the National University of Music Bucharest (September 2-6, 2019).

DISCIPLINES AND METHODOLOGIES

Political and demographic changes, plus the loss and destruction of auxiliary social documentation, in many cases makes it impossible to reconstruct much of the musical creativity even of the recent past. It is much more productive to concentrate on those areas for which either social continuity survives – particularly in existing village societies – or in notated ecclesiastical or courtly music. During the past century much extremely valuable research has been conducted in these topics within several of the Balkan nations and in Turkey. Nevertheless, a broader historical synthesis would require the integration of many other kinds of data, particularly those which involve the interface of the urban centers and rural populations. But for these topics the sources are generally fewer and more difficult to interpret and to integrate into larger arguments.

Briefly, the relevant disciplines to create even a hypothetical musical history for these territories are the following:

1. Musicology – studying notated and other musical documents;
2. Ethnomusicology – studying current or recent musical practices and repertoires;
3. Historical Ethnomusicology – studying historically known practices of the relatively “recent” past, i.e. for which current oral practices may shed some light.

Written musical documents are produced by a Court, a church, or certain sectors of the educated urban population. Without the widespread use of musical notation, a great deal of social cooperation and stability is required to preserve complex musical repertoires. Studies have shown that where there is a combination of social cooperation and political stability, some complex repertoires may be preserved, even with the minimal use of notation. Such cooperation seems to have occurred in China, for example, far more than in most of the Middle East or in India/Pakistan. In general, religious institutions may have greater means to achieve musical preservation and transmission. In the Ottoman realm it would appear that a long era of musical stability and creativity only began after the middle of the 17th century, and extended for the following two and a half centuries.

Western Europe had invested heavily in musical notation for several musical repertoires over many centuries. Orthodox Eastern Europe also had various forms of notation, but mainly for ecclesiastical (“esoteric”) musical repertoires. Neither Muslim nor Jewish cultures saw much need for musical notation. This only began to change in the Ottoman civilization at the beginning of the 18th century, which eventually produced several Islamic and Armenian notational systems, in addition to the Byzantine notation used by

Greek cantors also for secular music. The later phases of these notations are the materials for the long-term *Corpus Musicae Ottomanicae* (CMO), Project of the Westphalian University of Münster.

Despite the existence of Ottoman musical notation – even at a recent conference at Istanbul Technical University on *Writing the History of Ottoman Music* (Istanbul, 2011), the tone of many of the papers was rather skeptical of the feasibility of creating a musical history of Ottoman Turkey, in a manner comparable to that of the West. The one invited scholar of medieval Western music – Professor Andreas Haug of Würzburg – had to “problematize the musical paradigms of modern Western culture as a model for philological, historical, aesthetical, and artistic reconstruction of music from cultures that do not conform to modern Western conditions” (Haug 2015: 231). That is to say, in the absence of these conditions, other methodological approaches need to be developed.

A rather different approach to the study of music has been taken by some Russian musicologists such as Boris Asafiev and Izaly Zemtsovsky (see Asafiev 1947, 1987 and Zemtsovsky 2012, 2018). They have written at length about the dominance of particular forms of “intonatsia”, musical “articulation” and “ethno-hearing” among many ethnic groups in the world. In their usage, “intonatsia” covers timbre, approaches to the expression of pitches, so-called “ornamentation” of these pitches, typical scales, modes and melodic progressions, preferences in tempo, etc. Members of a single ethnos, speaking a single language or its dialects, usually share a musical “intonatsia” over a broad geographical area. And it would appear that this “intonatsia” may persist for centuries – although of course this is impossible to prove empirically prior to the existence of sound recording. Nevertheless, even partial information about musical practices – where they exist – can suggest either continuity or changes within this “intonatsia” and “ethno-hearing” of each culture. The ethnic musical “intonatsia” can be common enough to be used as the basis for musical creativity in new social and political circumstances.

While some aspects of “intonatsia” may be represented through Western staff notation, others demand different kinds of indication or description. For our purposes the issue of musical “intonatsia” involves both issues of musical description synchronically, and the creation of hypotheses about diffusion, stability and change diachronically. The musical life of the Court, the city and the village present different sorts of evidence in this regard. One of the most obvious areas of analysis is musical tempo. Within villages and sometimes nearby towns, it is possible to map typical understandings of tempo within dance. Within the same country, e.g. modern Turkey, whole regions

may present distinctive usages of tempo for folk dance, whether for the same dance type or for different dances. These differences in tempo imply different conceptions of body movement and posture. In some cases – e.g. in Central Anatolia – recent research by Janos Sipos has demonstrated common features of musical rhythm and tempo, not only associated with dance, with the natives of the Aral Sea region of Kazakhstan (see Sipos 2001). This would imply retention of shared musical features over many centuries, as the key element connecting these regions goes back to the westward demographic movement of Oghuz Turks roughly a millennium ago.

Within the borders of modern Greece, differences in dance tempo frequently distinguish folkdances of the mainland and of many of the islands. Deeper into Eastern Europe, Ashkenazic Jews consistently had danced at a much slower tempo than neighboring peoples. This had been true even in Moldova, and even in the cases where dance repertoires had been borrowed in both directions.

Thus, in much of Eastern Europe and in the Ottoman Balkans and Anatolia in particular, differing musical “intonatsias” often came into contact. While certain forms of rural vocal music probably retained archaic local musical techniques, other genres – especially in dance music – reflect inter-ethnic connections. But within these areas of greater contact, specific regional or ethnic norms of performance or “intonatsia” often led to transformations of shared material. Examples abound: e.g. shared musical genres of Turks and Greeks in the Aegean/Bosphorus area; dance music of multi-ethnic “Macedonia”; Hungarians and Romanians in Transylvania; and shared instrumental dance repertoires of Moldavians and Jews in Bessarabia (Chiseliță 2008; Feldman 2016: 347-366). In spite of similarities in structure and genre, the insider to any of these cultures (or even the musically informed outsider) can immediately perceive whether he/she is listening to a Turkish *zeybek* dance melody or song or to a Greek *zeimbekiko*; to a Moldavian *bulgăreasca* dance or to a Jewish *bulgarish*. Performers within these cultures absorb the musical information needed to recreate an originally borrowed musical genre or even a specific melody, according to the musical norms of his/her own ethnic community.

In other cases, even archaic vocal repertoires may survive in very similar musical form and “intonatsia”, yet utilizing more than one ethnic language. The locus classicus for this phenomenon may be the polyphonic singing of the Vlach, Albanian and Greek-speakers of the South-Western Balkans. The American ethnomusicologist Jane Sugarman has done extensive research on the social context of Albanian Muslim polyphonic singing (see Sugarman

1997), while the Vlakh language songs have been collected extensively by Speranța Rădulescu. An early, non-musicological study of the Albanian-language sung texts in the Orthodox Christian repertoire of Northern Epirus had been published in the US by the local journalist Pyrrhus Ruches (see Ruches 1967).

Among Romanian scholars, interested in urban/rural musical relations, we may name Constantin Brăiloiu and then Tiberiu Alexandru, and especially Gheorghe Ciobanu, who devoted much work to uncovering musical relations within the city, including local secular Byzantine notations. This research usually involved some awareness of the Greek and Turkish components in urban musical culture. The American Robert Garfias' work on *muzica lăutărească* (see Garfias 1981) focussed on the elements of Turkish modal usage that still survived into the middle of the 20th century. But it is now much clearer that the currently known mainly instrumental repertoire is not older than the last third of the 19th century, and some of it much newer. The older professional music of the Wallachian and Moldavian cities had been predominantly vocal, and had featured a combination of Greco-Turkish and Western musical practices. The element coming from Romanian peasant music was quite limited. To some extent Ottoman courtly music was known in the Principalities, but to what degree and on what artistic level would require deeper research into notated sources.

Among purely rural populations the multiple types of musical "intonatsia" and form as represented by Christian and Muslim populations sharing certain musical genres in many regions in several countries, may yet supply rich material for musical research. This even despite the multiple demographic changes these regions have undergone. Wherever local Sufi groups still exist among either the town or the village populations, yet other musical questions will arise.

MUSICAL LIFE IN THE OTTOMAN BALKANS

In the post World War II era, the study of Ottoman history has made highly significant advances within academia in the Republic of Turkey, and in several Western countries. But in the West, the interest in the historical and political importance of the Ottoman Empire has long overshadowed the need to study Ottoman culture, especially beyond the Court. This attitude severely impeded any serious development of Ottoman cultural and artistic studies, with the partial exception of architecture, in that it was usually monumental and often commissioned by the Court. To examine the musical impact of the Ottoman centuries on the all Balkan nations would demand a much

higher level of cooperation among Ottoman historians and cultural scholars. Our recent conference held at NYU Abu Dhabi, *A Locally Generated Modernity: The Ottoman Empire in the "Long" 18th Century* (February 2018), was one such attempt to integrate historical and cultural developments among both the Muslim and non-Muslim populations. This initial conference focussed on the broad area between Istanbul and Bucharest. In fact, the cultural networks within the Empire also integrated the major cities of the Middle East, from Baghdad, to Aleppo, Damascus and Cairo. These networks need to be explored much more fully in relation to both their Muslim and the non-Muslim populations. But for our present purposes we will confine our discussion to the European provinces of the Ottoman Empire. We will contend that between the later 17th and the early 19th centuries the urban populations – among all religious and linguistic groups – in the capital and the major European Ottoman cities, developed many common musical practices, from the highest courtly level, touching on religious and Sufi repertoires, and also reflected in a variety of more popular secular genres.

On the one hand, the Ottoman capital became the locus for many sorts of absorption of regional styles and a diffusion point for artistic, religious, military and entertainment music. Other Ottoman cities (such as Salonika, Larissa, Üsküp/Skopje, Filibe/Plovdiv or Vidin) fulfilled these functions on a smaller scale. The Greek Macedonian city Kastoria was a major entrepot linking the Moldo-Wallachian fur trade with the Ottoman capital. On the other hand, the Balkans contain some of the most remote and marginal territories in Europe, reminiscent of the South Italian village described by Carlo Levi in *Christ Stopped at Eboli* (1945), whose inhabitants in the mid-20th century were impervious to all cultural influences coming from the outside, whether Greek, Roman or Christian. The Albanian novelist Ismail Kadare created the entire theme of his novel, *The Three Arched Bridge* (1978), on the dire consequences of the gradual penetration of Albania's physical isolation, first by Western European traders and then by the Ottoman conquerors. Thus, the Balkan territories were home both to areas rather well-connected with the major Ottoman cities, as well as those that were barely reachable from any city.

Thanks to abundant research conducted from the middle to the later 20th century, especially in Romania and Bulgaria, and elsewhere in the Balkan territories, it is possible to describe many of the forms of collective and solo musical genres (mainly of a vocal nature) that are or were performed in villages. These are repertoires of remarkable richness and beauty, which are often sharply differentiated not only by language group and eth-

nos, but sometimes by very specific traditions carried on within particular regions of a country. Usually a given of the ethnomusicological research in the modern Balkan nations was a predilection for documentation and analysis of the village musics and rituals of the peasant majorities of these countries. These had generally been the dominant language groups of the existing nations prior to the Ottoman or Habsburg Imperial eras. However, in order to gain a truer understanding of the actual musical conditions and relations in the centuries immediately preceding the modern era, it is necessary to reimagine almost all of the Balkan territories at a time when urban populations frequently spoke and wrote a language different from the surrounding villages, and sometimes also practiced a different religion. The musical implications of this abundant reality were evident in almost every region of the Balkan countries existing today.

Prior to the 19th century our knowledge of many aspects of the musical life of many Balkan cities and regions is extremely limited. Despite the mention of “villages” in our title, most of the material presented here will be concerned with cities and towns, with occasional mentions of rural groups and their musical genres. Because of their major presence in the Ottoman capital it is possible to assess the role of Greek musicians and composers – at least from the later 17th century on – over several social strata. But the situation of the European provincial cities is far more obscure. Despite their critical importance to the military and political history of the Ottoman Empire, it does not appear that the cities of Serbia, Albania nor Bosnia contributed much to the development of Ottoman music. This major disconnect between political and cultural spheres requires much greater explanation.

One avenue to pursue in attempting to better understand the musical integration of the Ottoman Empire was the role of the Mevlevi dervishes. This dervish order was brought into existence in the early 14th century by Sultan Veled (d. 1312), the son of the major mystical poet Jalaluddin Rumi (d. 1273). It was strengthened and spread by his successors, until it finally became identified as a major cultural institution of the Ottoman Empire. By the 16th century at the latest, the Mevlevi had created their own unique form of mystical musical performance and composition, known as the *ayin* or *mukabele*. And they also were known as masters of secular Courtly music. The existence of their convents (Mevlevihanes) had been crucial to maintaining artistic Ottoman musical standards in such cities as Salonika, Larissa, Üsküp, Filibe and Vidin, whose Mevlevihanes had been established as early as the later 16th century. However, we lack information about the activities of their musicians both in their own towns, and their relations with the Ottoman cap-

ital. It is known from the earlier 20th century that even smaller provincial Mevlevihanes (such as that of Kilis in South Eastern Anatolia) had a formative effect on local musical life. Prior to the end of Ottoman rule, and even for some time afterward, the same was true in Aleppo, Damascus and Tripoli (Trablus). But to what extent this may also have been true of Mevlevi centers in Serbia or Bulgaria, for example, is not known. Mevlevi dervish musicians taught capable students of all religions. The adoption of many Ottoman musical practices by Greek *psaltes* (cantors) and the creation of the Ottoman Hebrew repertoire known as “Maftirim” by Sephardic Jewish *hazzanim* (cantors) was a result of Mevlevi musical teaching between the 17th and the earlier 20th centuries. Indeed, the last composer in this Hebrew genre, Moshe Cordoba, had been born in Edirne and passed away in Tel-Aviv in 1965.

In the 1980s the historian Suraiya Faroqui was able to examine the records of the Mevlevi center (Asitane) of Konya, including records of the musicians from the 16th to the later 17th centuries, but similar research was not accomplished when these Balkan Mevlevihanes had been intact (Faroqui 1988). Judging by recent research in Turkey (2007), it would appear that the Mevlevi Zaviye of Lefköse in Cyprus can still be researched to some degree.

These inter-religious musical contacts have been documented mainly within Istanbul, and in İzmir, Edirne and Salonika. Other dervish orders, especially the Bektaşî and Halvetî, were diffused in other urban and rural centers throughout the Balkans. The impact of the non-Mevlevi, less elite dervish orders, can sometimes still be researched. The French scholar Nathalie Clayer had studied Bektaşîs in Albania, and the Hungarians Janos Sipos and Eva Csaki (2009) had conducted field work among rural Bektaşîs and Alevis in Turkish Thrace.

In general, the various Balkan regions presented different patterns of pan-Ottoman integration, both laterally across regions, and vertically, across social classes and religions. For example, Pristina in Kosovo, and Üsküp in Macedonia were integrated culturally with the Ottoman capital and other major Balkan cities. The leader in this pattern may have been Saray-i Bosna (Sarajevo). Beograd (Fehérvár) had a rather different social history in this regard, with greater ties to the North in Hungary. In most regions village musical practices seem to have had little currency in the towns. Whereas, it appears that several urban and rural musical styles may have coexisted in a southern Albanian city such as Korça. Various genres of Greek folkdance were known also among the Muslims in Istanbul, in particular as the professional urban dancing boys (*köçek*) were often of Greek island origin. There is also

some evidence for the performance of Bulgarian dances in early 19th century Istanbul (see Pardoe 1838), and some of the songs of the urban dancing boys from that period contain Bulgarian references (see Feldman 2000). But little evidence survives pointing to the existence of folkloric styles from the more westerly regions of the Balkans, such as Serbia or Bosnia, within the popular music and dance of the capital.

Geographically remote Moldova held more significance to the musical life of Istanbul through the personality of the great Ottoman musician Prince Demetrius Cantemir (d. 1723), the late 18th century violinist Kemani Miron, and the popular dance music antecedent to the *kasap/sırba* and the *longa*. The latter dances were diffused throughout much of the Balkan, Greek and even Arab territories to the South, and among Ashkenazic Jews to the North. During the 18th century the Phanariot regime in the Danubian Principalities, including both Greeks and Hellenized natives, proved to be the most effective musical Ottomanizers. And it was for this reason that the secular musical life of both Bucharest and Iași can be researched to some degree during this period. Between 1711 and 1812 even provincial Bessarabia was drawn closer into the orbit of the Ottoman capital, as the Empire invested both in its defense against Russia and Poland, and in its overall economy (which was led principally by Greeks, and by Sephardic and Ashkenazic Jews) speaking Ladino and Yiddish respectively.

It would appear that a Greco-Ottoman musical component had been fundamental to the formation of the professional *klezmer* repertoire since the 17th century, and is documented in musical notation as far West as Berlin by the middle of the 18th century in the manuscript of Aaron Beer (Feldman 2016: 17). Ottoman music (both of dance and mehter/military nature) was mentioned in other accounts in both Poland and Bohemia at the same period. Other manifestations of these musical phenomena developed among the general population of cities and smaller towns throughout the European provinces, each one representing the linguistic, ethnic and professional composition of particular locales. It has been possible to document some of these movements within popular music from Moldova to Istanbul thanks to the cattle tribute that linked these Danubian regions to the Ottoman capital for many centuries (Feldman 2016: 347-366). This led to the genesis of the *kasap/sırba* dance of the butchers' guild (Greek *hassapiko*; Moldavian *bulgărească*). Although much less researched, it is not unlikely that the musical trail from Kastoria to Istanbul had once showed somewhat similar features, thanks to the fur trade. And indeed, the furriers (*kürkücü*) and the butchers (*kasap*) represented two of the most influential guilds of the capital.

The Ashkenazic Jewish components among the urban musical cultures of Moldova has been the subject of recent research by Speranța Rădulescu in Botoșani, and longstanding research by Vasile Chiseliță in the Academy of Sciences in Chișinău on musical sources from Northern Bucovina (2008). Among the earliest of these was published in 1938 by the prominent Romanian sociologist Dumitrie Gusti (Delion 1994). This early research documents the Moldavian Christian adaptation of the Jewish dance known as *khosidl* (which was always composed and performed by professional Jewish musicians known as “klezmer”) as the “husid” at Christian peasant weddings, as part of the *cîntec de pahar* (“song of the cup”) wedding repertoire. I was able to conduct field work on this general topic in the Republic of Moldova, Germany, Israel and Canada between 2011 and 2015.

Turning to the urban art music traditions, is also an important fact that the overall style of Ottoman music itself changed significantly in the course of the 18th century. This included finer gradations among musical pitches, decrease in overall musical tempo, and longer melodic periods stretched over yet longer rhythmic cycles. Some – although not all – of these new developments appear to have brought Ottoman music closer to Post-Byzantine musical practices. As a result, in a wide geographical swath, reaching from Istanbul to Bucharest and Iași, the urban musical practices featured an acculturation of the Islamicate and the Greek Orthodox traditions. This newer history of Ottoman music during the “long” 18th century runs counter to the kind of “national” argument that appeared among the proponents of Romanian church chant in the 19th century (see Moisil 2011). Thus, we cannot view the Ottoman musical presence as an unchanging influence reflecting only Turkic or Islamic traditions, although it certainly retained elements of both.

This question is in fact just one part of the much larger issue of the interaction of Ottoman and Neo-Byzantine music during this period. Despite some relatively early (16th century) documents of Ottoman secular music in the Byzantine notation, this musical interface only becomes a major movement by the second half of the 17th century. While the music of the Greek Church was of course continuous in the Ottoman capital, in Edirne, İzmir and other major cities, the Muslim elite classes do not seem to have shown interest in it. Rather their musical focus was principally on Iran and on local artistic creations of the makam tradition. Within this tradition, the musical practices of the Mevlevi dervishes loomed large. It was only following several profound political crises and structural realignments of the State during the 17th century, that led to a new political and social system that recent Ottoman historians sometimes refer to as the “Second Ottoman Empire” (see

Tezcan 2007). Within this new structure, elites among the Christian groups (principally Greeks and Armenians) found new opportunities. These new realities began to show their effects within the musical productions of these elites, from the Mevlevi dervishes, to the Ottoman Court and the composers of the Orthodox Church. By the later 17th century we can hear mutual musical echoes in the music of Petros Bereketis and Buhurizade Itri. But it is only in the generation following Cantemir that we see manifest Byzantine musical features entering Ottoman music, as well as Greek church composers, such as Zacharias Hanendes and Petros Peloponnēsios, assuming positions of authority as creators of the Ottoman repertoire.

DEMOGRAPHICS OF TOWN AND VILLAGE

One enduring legacy of the Ottoman period in the Balkans proper (i.e. South of the Danube) came through indigenous populations converting to Islam and creating Islamized forms of native musical genres. This usually involved some new developments between an older native style, and the norms more typical of both urban Turkish and sometimes Greek musical practices. This process of Islamization predominated in much of Old Serbia (known in Ottoman times as the Sancak and Kosovo), in Bosnia, in some parts of Bulgaria, areas of Greece and much of Albania. In recent decades (especially after ca. 1990) the process of “re-Orientalization” through popular musical genres purveyed by Roma/Gypsies has been frequently mentioned and documented. But the cultural process to which we are referring here was characteristic of many social classes in a very broad geographical area over several centuries. Indeed, in many of these areas from Bosnia to Crete, it was often the urban upper and middle classes who became Muslim, rather than only the peasantry or the Roma. While the upper classes in the past had also mastered the Turkish language (and at times even Persian) they generally retained their indigenous languages as a vernacular, and sometimes (as in Bosnia) also as a literary poetic language. The official military and ceremonial music of the Ottoman state and army (the *mehterhane*) was also a unifying force throughout the Empire.

But Islamization and/or partial Turkification was hardly the only form of linguistic and ethnic transformation throughout the Balkan territories. Between the 16th and the later 18th century it is possible to map a great many smaller or larger cases of identity switches. In most cases these changes remained within a single religious group. Thus, beginning in Moldova/Bessarabia in the Northeast, we see significant absorption

of Ukrainian/Ruthenian speakers as Moldavians; smaller absorption of Sephardic and Tatar-speaking Krymchaks as Ashkenazic Jews. Some of the other groups resisted assimilation, such as the older Hungarian-speakers (Csango) of northern Moldova who retained their linguistic and some of their musical identity.

After the 16th century Crimea saw the absorption of the ancient Gothic population as Greeks; and the linguistic assimilation of Armenians to the Kumano-Tatar language. This led to the formation of the “Armeno-Kypchaq” language, documented in the Armenian ecclesiastical center of Kamenec-Podolsk. The mid-18th century also saw some conversion of East Slavic, Romanian and possibly Tatar-speakers to Judaism (as the “Geri”) in Northern Bessarabia; as well as larger-scale conversion of Jews to Orthodox Christianity, mainly west of the river Prut. The linguistic border separating Romanian from Serbian shifted significantly in Ottoman times, as many ethnic Romanians adopted the Serbian language and identity. Much of the older Serbian population of the southeast had retained their language but accepted the Islamic religion. After the 17th century much of their original territory was occupied by Albanian Muslims. In some cases, the loss of the older language led also to the loss of the folksong repertoire in that language. But research within the Republic of Moldova would indicate that the musical assimilation of some of the local Ruthenians (“Rus”) was only partial. In general, it may still be fruitful to examine local folksong repertoires and performance style bearing in mind cases of widespread linguistic and identity shifts within recent centuries.

Apart from processes of gradual ethnic or linguistic assimilation, most of the modern Balkan nations have been the scenes of large-scale demographic changes, disturbances and expulsions. These extended from Bosnia-Herzegovina in the West to the Crimea in the East, over several generations and continuing until our own days. While in some areas it may be possible to reconstruct some of the musical practices in urban or nearby rural environments, in the cases where the expulsions and exchanges were more than two or three generations old, the results will be rather meagre. Such is the case for example, among the Muslims of Crete (whose descendants live in Turkey or Syria) or among the Tatars of the Crimea (whose descendants are either in Turkey), or had spent at least one generation in Uzbekistan before returning to the Crimea or emigrating to the US. Research among the Tatars in Uzbekistan and in Turkey reveals that almost all musical materials had been preserved by a handful of professional musicians. Some additional research among local Tatars had been accomplished in Romanian Dobrogea (by Gisela Sulițeanu) and by foreign researchers.

While the Crimea is peripheral to the Balkans proper, and was not considered an Ottoman province, nevertheless the musical history of this country is related both to the Balkans and to the Ottoman capital. Due to the existence of a high musical and literary culture in its principal cities, it is possible to outline certain patterns in the development of both artistic and folkloric music in the Crimea. The 16th century Khan Ghazi Giray was a major Ottoman composer and the late 17th century Khan Selim Giray was an important patron of Ottoman art music. On the popular level the national Crimean dance, *qaytarma* had its reflexes from eastern Bulgaria as the *rutchenitsa* to the Dobrogea as the *geamparale*. But periods of ethnic depopulation, beginning in the later 18th century, and reaching its climax in the Stalinist mass deportations of the 1940s, render the musical history of the Crimea most enigmatic.

And added to all this were the Turkic groups who preceded the Ottomans in Macedonia and Thrace (including the Christian Turkish Gagauz) and Alevi Turks settled among Bulgarians.

CONCLUSION

With materials as varied as those mentioned above, areas of possible future research would demand a variety of methodologies to deal with the various corpus's involved, according to the three musicological disciplines mentioned above. Some topics can be dealt with within a single country and language area. But other topics demand collaboration of scholars commanding different skills and materials, who would usually represent different countries. As we have mentioned, the Ottoman era brought about different sorts of social and musical communication within the court environment, among Mevlevi and other Sufi groups, and with musicians of the Orthodox Church and within the Sephardic synagogues. Various professional movements brought about contact between rather remote regions and the Ottoman capital. Professional performing groups, comprising both musicians and dancers, brought together members of several religions and languages. Even within villages (and among pastoral groups) switches of language and identity sometimes had musical results. But at other times they did not have such results, where a local "intonatsia" seems to have transcended switches of language. These in turn may reflect an older regional identity, prior to later adoption of the vernaculars in use in recent generations. Of course, when dealing with issues older than the last three centuries, there always needs to be a balance between empirical proof, on the one hand, and creative scholarly imagina-

tion, on the other. Especially in a part of the world where ethnic and national identities are still being contested, we always will need a dialogue among various possible interpretations of known data, without a priori conclusions that accord with partisan interpretations of history and ethnicity. Nevertheless, the field is an exceedingly rich one.

REFERENCES

Asafiev, Boris

- 1947 *Muzykal'naia form kak protses* [Musical Form as Process] (Moscow).
 1987 *O narodnoimuzyke* [About the National Music], eds. Izalij Zemtsovskij and Alma Kunanbaeva (Leningrad: Muzyka).

Chiseliță, Vasile

- 2008 "Interferențe culturale evreiești în muzica tradițională de dans în Basarabia și Bucovina" [Jewish Cultural Interferences of the Bessarabia and Bukovina Traditional Dance Music], in *Anuarul Institutului de Etnografie și Folclor "Constantin Brăiloiu"* [Yearbook of the Constantin Brăiloiu Institute of Ethnography and Folklore], 19, 201-22.

Delion, Pavel

- 1994 *Folclor muzical din Vancicăuți, Bălcăuți, Cernăuți: colecție de cântece și microbiografie a lui Ion N. Kiriak* [Musical Folklore from Vancicauti, Balcauti, Chernivtsi: Collection of Songs and Microbiography of Ion N. Kiriak] (Iași: Graphix).

Farouqi, Suraiya

- 1988 "Agricultural Crisis and the Art of Flute Playing: 1595-1652", *Turcica*, 20, 43-70.

Feldman, Walter Zev

- 2000 *Notes to Lalezar: Music of the Dancing Boys* (New York: Traditional Crossroads Records).
 2016 *Klezmer: Music, History and Memory* (Oxford University Press).

Garfias, Robert

- 1981 "Survivals of Turkish Characteristics in Romanian Muzica Lăutărească", *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, 13, 97-107.

Haug, Andreas

2015 "Reconstructing Western 'Monophonic' Music", in *Writing the History of "Ottoman Music"*, ed. Martin Greve (Würzburg: Ergon), 231-40.

Moisil, Costin

2011 "Romanian vs. Greek-Turkish-Persian-Arab: Imagining National Traits for Romanian Church Chant", *Muzikologija* [Musicology], 11, 119-30.

Pardoe, Julie

1838 *The Beauties of the Bosphorus* (London: George Virtue).

Ruches, Pyrrhus

1967 *Albanian Historical Folksongs: 1716-1943. A Survey of Epic Poetry from Southern Albania with Original Texts* (Chicago: Argonaut Press).

Sipos, Janos and Eva Csaki

2001 *Kazakh Folksongs from the Two Ends of the Steppe* (Budapest).

2009 *The Psalms and Folk Songs of a Mystic Order* (Budapest).

Sugarman, Jane C.

1997 *Engendering Song: Singing and Subjectivity at Prespa Albanian Weddings*, Chicago Studies in Ethnomusicology (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press).

Tezcan, Baki

2007 *The Second Ottoman Empire: Political and Social Transformations in the Early Modern World* (Cambridge University Press).

Zemtsovsky, Izaly

2013 "Ethnic Hearing in the Sociocultural Margins: Identifying *Homo Musicans Polyethnoaudiens*", in *Garment and Core: Jews and their Musical Experiences* (Ramat Gan: Bar Ilan), 13-30.

2018 "Do We Need a Concept of 'Musical Substance'?", *Revista de Etnografie și Folclor* [Journal of Ethnography and Folklore], New Series, 1-2, 163-89.